



Case Western Reserve Law Review

Volume 55 | Issue 4

2005

Volume 55 Issue 4 (2005)

Case Western Reserve University Law Review

Follow this and additional works at: <https://scholarlycommons.law.case.edu/caselrev>



Part of the [Law Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

Case Western Reserve University Law Review, *Volume 55 Issue 4 (2005)*, 55(4) Case W. Res. L. Rev. Front Matter (2005)
Available at: <https://scholarlycommons.law.case.edu/caselrev/vol55/iss4/2>

This Front Matter is brought to you for free and open access by the Student Journals at Case Western Reserve University School of Law Scholarly Commons. It has been accepted for inclusion in Case Western Reserve Law Review by an authorized administrator of Case Western Reserve University School of Law Scholarly Commons.



CASE

SCHOOL OF LAW

k
3
A76
c.2

JAN 10 2006

CASE WESTERN RESERVE LAW REVIEW

VOLUME 55

SUMMER 2005

NUMBER 4

LAW TECHNOLOGY & THE ARTS SYMPOSIUM: "COPYRIGHT AND PERSONAL COPYING: *SONY V. UNIVERSAL STUDIOS* TWENTY-ONE YEARS LATER"

REWINDING *SONY*: THE EVOLVING PRODUCT, PHONING HOME
AND THE DUTY OF ONGOING DESIGN

RANDAL C. PICKER

BREAKING THE VICIOUS CIRCULARITY: *SONY*'S CONTRIBUTION
TO THE FAIR USE DOCTRINE

FRANK PASQUALE

SONY, TORT DOCTRINES, AND THE PUZZLE OF PEER-TO-PEER

ALFRED C. YEN

COMMENT: AN ALTERNATIVE TORTS MODEL OF
SECONDARY COPYRIGHT LIABILITY

DAVID W. BARNES

THE PROBLEMS OF JUDGING YOUNG TECHNOLOGIES:
A COMMENT ON *SONY*, TORT DOCTRINES,
AND THE PUZZLE OF PEER-TO-PEER

R. ANTHONY REESE

KEYNOTE: FAIR USE: THREAT OR THREATENED?

WENDY J. GORDON

THE *SONY* PARADOX

JESSICA LITMAN

COMMENT: COPYRIGHT'S PUBLIC-PRIVATE DISTINCTION

JULIE E. COHEN

COMMENT: *SONY*, FAIR USE, AND FILE SHARING

STACEY L. DOGAN

SONY IN THE TRENCHES

JAMES BURGER,
MATTHEW J. OPPENHEIM &
MICHAEL PETRICONE

NOTES

SLAMMING THE LID ON PANDORA'S BOX: HOW THE OHIO
LEGISLATURE COMPENSATED THE INSURANCE INDUSTRY
FOR *SCOTT-PONTZER* AT THE EXPENSE OF OHIO'S DRIVERS

MATTHEW J. CAVANAGH

Continued on Back Cover

CWRU LAW LIBRARY

**CASE
WESTERN
RESERVE
LAW REVIEW**

Volume 55, Number 4
Summer 2005



CASE
SCHOOL OF LAW

CASE WESTERN RESERVE LAW REVIEW

VOLUME 55

SUMMER 2005

NUMBER 4

Managing Editor

KIMBERLY A. EBERWINE

Editor in Chief

ANDREW THOMPSON

Publisher

MARISSA RACHEL DUCCA

Executive Articles Editor

NATHANIEL STEWART

Executive Contributing Editor

KURT ANDREW LEEPER

Executive Notes Editor

JUSTIN RYAN PATIN

Associate Coordinator

MICHAEL JOSEPH BLALOCK

Articles Editors

GREG J. ALER

DANIEL JAMES BENNETT

DAVID J. GROVER

ERICA HARRINGTON

JOHN JOSEPH HARRINGTON

Contributing Editors

BENJAMIN D. CRAMER

CAROL TYLER FOX

DOUGLAS FRIES

Notes Editors

TODD E. BEHRENS

ERIC L. BILLINGS

MATTHEW J. CAVANAGH

AFIF MAHMOUD GHANNOUM

TAYLOR MICHELE WESLEY

Associates

DANIEL A. APPLGATE

RAMI BARDENSTEIN

JESSICA BENSON

CATHERINE L. BUCHER

PATRICK D. BURNS

SARA BUSCH

ALEXANDER CLARK

LISA M. COX

CATHERINE M. FRENCH

DEBORAH L. GOODRICH

JASON R. GROVE

NORAH J. GUEQUIERRE

BRADLEY W. HARRISON

JUSTIN HUGHES

JOSLYN E. KAYE

GREGORY A. LEWIS

TASIA MCINTYRE

KEVIN PENDERGAST

KEVIN M. SAMUELS

BRIAN W. SCHREYER

JOHN LOGAN SCHRIVER

JAY C. STIFFLER

JOHN TITLEY

ALEXANDER VAN VOORHEES

Faculty Advisor

DALE A. NANCE

CASE WESTERN RESERVE UNIVERSITY
SCHOOL OF LAW FACULTY

Administrative Officers

GERALD KORNGOLD, B.A., J.D., *Dean*
HIRAM E. CHODOSH, *Associate Dean for Academic Affairs*
BARBARA F. ANDELMAN, B.A., J.D., *Associate Dean for Student Services, Enrollment Planning and Special Projects*
ELIZABETH KLUSAS, B.A., J.D., *Assistant Dean for Career Services*

Professors Emeriti

PETER D. JUNGER, A.B., LL.B.
JAMES W. MCELHANEY, A.B., LL.B., *Joseph C. Hostetter Professor Emeritus of Trial Practice and Advocacy*
EDWARD A. MEARNES, JR., B.S., LL.B.
SIDNEY I. PICKER, JR., A.B., LL.B., LL.M.
HUGH A. ROSS, B.S., LL.B., LL.M., S.J.D.
OLIVER C. SCHROEDER, JR., A.B., J.D., *Albert J. Weatherhead III and Richard W. Weatherhead Professor Emeritus*

Professors of Law

ARTHUR D. AUSTIN II, B.S., J.D.
Edgar A. Hahn Professor of Jurisprudence
LAURA BROWN CHISOLM, B.A., J.D.
HIRAM E. CHODOSH, B.A., J.D.
Joseph C. Hostetter – Baker & Hostetter Professor of Law
RONALD J. COFFEY, A.B., LL.B., LL.M.
GEORGE W. DENT, JR., B.A., J.D., LL.M.
Schott-van den Eynden Professor of Business Organizations Law
MELVYN R. DURCHSLAG, B.S., J.D.
JONATHAN L. ENTIN, A.B., J.D.
Professor of Law and Political Science
LEON GABINET, PH.B., J.D.
Director of Graduate Tax Program
PETER M. GERHART, B.A., J.D.
PAUL C. GIANNELLI, B.A., M.S.F.S., J.D., LL.M.
Albert J. Weatherhead III and Richard W. Weatherhead Professor of Law
KATHERINE M. HESSLER, B.A., J.D., LL.M.
ERIK M. JENSEN, S.B., M.A., J.D.
David L. Brennan Professor
LEWIS R. KATZ, A.B., J.D.
John C. Hutchins Professor and Director, Graduate Program for Foreign Students in U.S. & Global Legal Studies
HENRY T. KING, JR., B.A., LL.B.
Professor and U.S. Director, Canada—U.S. Law Institute
GERALD KORNGOLD, B.A., J.D.
Everett D. and Eugenia S. McCurdy Professor
JULIET P. KOSTRITSKY, A.B., J.D.
John Homer Kapp Professor
RAYMOND KU, A.B., J.D.
Associate Director, Center for Law, Technology, and the Arts
ROBERT P. LAWRY, B.A., J.D., DIP. LAW
Director, Center for Professional Ethics
WILBUR C. LEATHERBERRY, A.B., J.D.
Director, Skills Courses and Advocacy Programs
JUDITH P. LIPTON, B.A., M.S.S.W., J.D.
Co-Director, Milton A. Kramer Law Clinic Center
KENNETH R. MARGOLIS, B.A., J.D.
Co-Director, Milton A. Kramer Law Clinic Center
LOUISE W. MCKINNEY, B.A., J.D.
KEVIN C. MCMUNIGAL, B.A., J.D.
Judge Ben C. Green Professor
MAXWELL J. MEHLMAN, B.A., J.D.
Arthur E. Petersilge Professor, Professor of Bioethics and Director, Law-Medicine Center
ANDREW P. MORRIS, A.B., J.D., M.P.A., PH.D.
Galen J. Roush Professor of Business Law and Regulation
DALE A. NANCE, B.A., M.A., J.D.
CRAIG ALLEN NARD, B.A., J.D., LL.M., J.S.D.
Director, Center for Law, Technology, and the Arts
SPENCER NETH, B.A., J.D., LL.M.
MICHAEL P. SCHARF, A.B., J.D.
Director, Frederick K. Cox International Law Center
MORRIS G. SHANKER, B.S.E.E., M.B.A., J.D.
CALVIN WILLIAM SHARPE, B.A., M.A., J.D.
John Deaver Drinko—Baker & Hostetter Professor
ANN SOUTHWORTH, B.A., J.D.
THEODORE L. STEINBERG, B.A., PH.D.,
Professor of History and Law
ROBERT N. STRASSFELD, B.A., M.A., J.D.
MARTHA WOODMANSEE, B.A., M.A. PH.D.
Professor of English and Law

Associate Professors of Law

JONATHAN H. ADLER, B.A., J.D., *Associate Director, Center for Business Law and Regulation*
JESSICA WILEN BERG, B.A., J.D.
KATHLEEN M. CARRICK, B.A., M.L.S., J.D., *Director of the Library*
WILLIAM M. CARTER, JR., B.S., J.D.
TIMOTHY CASEY, B.A., J.D., LL.M.
JEFFREY D. DILLMAN, B.A., J.D.
SHARONA HOFFMAN, B.A., J.D., LL.M.
KENNETH F. LEDFORD, B.A., J.D., M.A., PH.D., *Associate Professor of History and Law*
JACQUELINE D. LIPTON, B.A., LL.B., LL.M., PH.D.
MATTHEW ROSSMAN, B.A., J.D.

Assistant Professors of Law

OLUFUNMILAYO B. AREWA, B.A., M.A., PH.D., A.M., J.D.
CRAIG M. BOISE, B.S., J.D., LL.M.
BRIAN K. GRAN, B.A., J.D., PH.D.
JESSIE B. HILL, B.A., J.D.
EMORY G. LEE, III, B.A., PH.D., J.D.

Instructors of Law

DAVID J. CARNEY, B.A., J.D.
PETER B. FRIEDMAN, B.A., J.D.
JONATHAN GORDON, B.A., J.D.
D. R. JONES, B.A., J.D., M.L.S.
KATHRYN S. MERCER, A.B., M.S.S.W., J.D., PH.D.

The CASE WESTERN RESERVE LAW REVIEW (ISSN 0008-7262), formerly the Western Reserve Law Review, is published quarterly by the students of the Case Western Reserve University School of Law. Periodicals postage paid at Cleveland, Ohio and at additional mailing offices. Editorial and business offices are located at Case Western Reserve University, 11075 East Boulevard, Cleveland, Ohio 44106, telephone (216) 368-3312. POSTMASTER: Send address changes to Case Western Reserve Law Review, 11075 East Boulevard, Cleveland, Ohio 44106. The submission of unsolicited manuscripts is invited. Subscriptions are entered for the entire volume for \$30.00 per year. Subscriptions are automatically renewable. The Review's policy requires that unless a claim for nonreceipt of an issue is received within three months after the mailing date, the Review cannot be held responsible for supplying that issue without charge. Single issues of the current volume are available for \$15.00 each. Back issues from earlier volumes are available from William S. Hein & Co., Inc., 1285 Main Street, Buffalo, New York 14209. Citations conform to *The Bluebook: A Uniform System of Citation* (17th ed. 2000), copyright by the Columbia Law Review, the Harvard Law Review, the University of Pennsylvania Law Review, and the Yale Law Journal. Style conforms generally to *The Chicago Manual of Style* (14th ed. 1993).

For all photocopy or republication requests, please contact Copyright Clearance Center, Inc. by mail: 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923, by phone: (978) 646-2600, by fax: (978) 646-8600, by email: infoat@copyright.com, or online: www.copyright.com. This issue went to press in July 2005.

CASE WESTERN RESERVE LAW REVIEW

VOLUME 55

SUMMER 2005

NUMBER 4

COPYRIGHT © 2005 BY CASE WESTERN RESERVE LAW REVIEW

LAW TECHNOLOGY & THE ARTS SYMPOSIUM: “COPYRIGHT AND PERSONAL COPYING: *SONY* V. *UNIVERSAL STUDIOS* TWENTY-ONE YEARS LATER”

REWINDING *SONY* : THE EVOLVING PRODUCT, PHONING HOME AND THE
DUTY OF ONGOING DESIGN

Randal C. Picker..... 749

BREAKING THE VICIOUS CIRCULARITY : *SONY*’S CONTRIBUTION TO THE
FAIR USE DOCTRINE

Frank Pasquale..... 777

SONY, TORT DOCTRINES, AND THE PUZZLE OF PEER-TO-PEER

Alfred C. Yen..... 815

COMMENT: AN ALTERNATIVE TORTS MODEL OF SECONDARY
COPYRIGHT LIABILITY

David W. Barnes..... 867

THE PROBLEMS OF JUDGING YOUNG TECHNOLOGIES: A COMMENT
ON *SONY*, TORT DOCTRINES, AND THE PUZZLE OF PEER-TO-PEER

R. Anthony Reese 877

KEYNOTE: FAIR USE: THREAT OR THREATENED?

Wendy J. Gordon..... 903

THE *SONY* PARADOX

Jessica Litman 917

COMMENT: COPYRIGHT’S PUBLIC-PRIVATE DISTINCTION

Julie E. Cohen..... 963

COMMENT: *SONY*, FAIR USE, AND FILE SHARING

Stacey L. Dogan..... 971

SONY IN THE TRENCHES

James Burger, Matthew J. Oppenheim &

Michael Petricone. 977

NOTES

SLAMMING THE LID ON PANDORA'S BOX: HOW THE OHIO LEGISLATURE
COMPENSATED THE INSURANCE INDUSTRY FOR *SCOTT-PONTZER* AT
THE EXPENSE OF OHIO'S DRIVERS

Matthew J. Cavanagh..... 997

ARGUABLY ARBITRARY: TAXATION AND THE PHYSICAL INJURY
REQUIREMENT OF I.R.C. SECTION 104(a)(2)

Kurt A. Leeper 1039

COMMENTS

CAN CONGRESS BUY RLUIPA'S WAY TO CONSTITUTIONAL SALVATION?

Benjamin D. Cramer..... 1073

THE FEDERAL SENTENCING GUIDELINES WEIGHT-LOSS PLAN: JUST HOW
MANDATORY ARE THE "ADVISORY" GUIDELINES AFTER *UNITED
STATES V. BOOKER*?

Douglas F. Fries..... 1097